SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: He is under the cloud of an inquiry.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The word *will not go on record.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: Madam, I did not say that he is *I merely said, he is *My accusation can go on record.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Well, I am not going into the intricacies of the word. But I must go through what your intention is.

SHORT DURATION DISCUSSION

SITUATION ARISING FROM HIKE IN SUGAR PRICE AND DELAY IN ITS IMPORT contd.

THE MINISTER OF STATE OF THE MINISTRY OF FOOD (SHRI KALP NATH RAI): Madam Deputy Chairman, the sugar production has been following a cyclical trend, that is, 2 to 3 years of high production followed by 2 to 3 years of low production. After reaching a record level of 134.11 lakh tonnes in 1991-92, the downward trend in the sugar cycle started.

[The Vice-Chairman, Syed Sibtey Razi, in the Chair]

During 1992-93 season, a production of 106.09 lakh tonnes was recorded and the current 1993-94 season is also a lean season. However, sugar production during the current season up to 31.12.93 had shown an increase of five per cent as compared to the sugar production on the corresponding date in the previous season. *(Interruptions)*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SYED SIBTEY RAZI): It is a reply. It is not a statement. *(Interruptions)* There is no convention.

SHRI KALP NATH RAI: The initial estimate of the Ministry of Agriculture for 1993-94 was higher at 231 million tonnes of sugarcane than last season's production of 230.8 million tonnes.

उपसभाध्यक्ष (सैयद सिब्ते रज़ी): मंत्री जी, आप कृपया धीरे-धीरे पढ़ें जिससे कि मैम्बर्स समझ सकें कि आप क्या कह रहे हैं। मैम्बर्स को यह एतराज है कि आप बहुत तेज़ रफ्तार से बढ़ रहे हैं इसलिए वे समझ नहीं पा रहे हैं कि आप क्या कह रहे हैं।

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA (West Bengal): Sir, normally, written statements are not given in reply. We are ready to listen to his written statement either prepared by him or prepared by somebody else. I do not know. But, he should read it in such a way that the Members can understand what he says.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SYED SIBTEY RAZI): I have already directed him to do so.

SHRI KALP NATH RAI: Keeping in view the slightly increased availability of sugarcane and increasing trend of sugar production, efforts were required to be made to increase the sugar production further and reduce its consumption to meet the demand of sugar in the country. With a view to boosting the sugar production in the current 1993-94 season, steps were taken by the Government which included:—

(i) grant of early, mid and late crushing incentives in the form of higher free sale quota;

(ii) request to the Finance Ministry and the RBI to provide needbased credit to the sugar industry;

(iii) request to the State Governments to ensure prompt clearance of cane price due to the farmers by the sugar factories;

(iv) enhancement in the loan component for grant of Sugar Development Fund assistance for K.T. Weirs and lift irrigation schemes from 66.6 per cent to 90 per cent of the project cost;

(v) increase in the Statutory Minimum Price (SMP) of sugarcane from Rs. 31 per quintal in 1992-93 season to Rs. 34.50 per quintal for 1993-94 season. *(Interruptions)*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SYED SIBTEY RAZI); Use your earphones. *(Interruptions)*

DR. BIPLAB DAS GUPTA: Sir, .he is quoting figures which are disputable. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Sir, it is not a rapid reading class of a primary school. We must understand what he says. *(Interruptions)*

*Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SYED SIBTEY RAZI): He will try to speak slowly.

SHRI KALP NATH RAI: (vi) Advance announcement of SMP of sugarcane for 1994-95 season at Rs. 37/- per quintal;

(vii) suitable revision in the incentive scheme for new sugar factories and expansion projects, and

(viii) request to the State Government for considering various measures to contain diversion of sugarcane to gur and khandsari.

Since January 1994 the increasing trend in sugar production as compared to previous season started showing a declining trend, senior officers of my Ministry were deputed to visit important sugar producing States and thereafter, a meeting of the State Secretaries dealing with sugar was held on 17.1.1994 where an estimate of 104 lakh tonnes of sugar was arrived at.

Diversion of sugarcane to gur and khandsari plays an important role in sugar production, more so in U.P., which is one of the major producers of sugar. Initially, at our initiative, the State Government had agreed to impose stock-holding limits and turn-over period restrictions on gur dealers to discourage speculative hoarding. But, even this order was withdrawn by them after about a fortnight which led to diversion of cane to gur on a large scale. Our estimate of sugar production, therefore, had to be revised to 96 lakh tonnes.

As it became clear that the sugar production would be of such an order as to necessitate imports to augment domestic availability, a decision was taken to allow imports of sugar under OGL and an announcement was made by me in the House of 15.3.94. No duty of customs or no additional duty of customs was levied on such imports. Further, in order to augment the supply of levy sugar for the public distribution system, STC and MMTC were also asked to import the required quantity of sugar so that PDS supplies could be maintained at the present level. As on 17.8.1994, a total quantity of about 9.49 lakh tonnes of sugar had been contracted by private parties for import, out of which about 7.18 lakh tonnes had arrived, 5.80 lakh tonnes unloaded and 2.20 lakh tonnes sent to the market. One of the major reasons for non- marketing of the aforesaid quantity of sugar has been the low realisation in the freesale market. *(Interruptions)...*

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Sir, it is not even a primary school, I say. *(Interruptions)...*

What is this? *(Interruptions)...* Sir, the most important issue which was raised was: Is it true or not that a senior bureaucrat has pointed out that there is likely to be a shortfall and it is ignored? Where is that point? *(Interruptions)...* What is he giving? What is this? *(Interruptions)...*

SHRI MD. SALIM (West Bengal): You are reading the statistics. *(Interruptions)...*

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Who wants this? We don't want this at all. *(Interruptions)...*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SYED SIBTEY RAZI): Hon. Members, I will request you to listen to the Minister first. After he completes his statement you are entitled to seek further clarifications, if something is left out. Yes, please, Minister. *(Interruptions)...*

प्रो. विजय कुमार मल्होत्रा: इसको ये पढ़ने के बजाय टेबिल पर रख दें क्योंकि समझ तो आ नहीं रहा है।

SHRI KALP NATH RAI: Sugar prices, which were showing an upward trend till the first fortnight of May, started declining thereafter and it was presumed that the importers held back these stocks in the hope that the prices would improve in the near future during the festival season, enabling them to offload the remaining quantity in the market. In a meeting held with the importers by the Secretary, Ministry of Food, on 10.8.1994, the importers gave an undertaking that they would dispose of about 1.4 lakh tonnes of sugar in the market during September, 1994.

श्री अनन्तराय देवशंकर दवे (गुजरात): महोदय, आप मंत्रीजी को कहिए कि जिस तरह धीमी गति के समाचार आते हैं, उस तरह पढ़िए।

SHRI KALP NATH RAI: The wholesale prices of sugar (S-30 grade) in the four principal markets of the country were ranging between Rs. 1,038 and Rs. 1,190 per quintal in the beginning of the current 1993-94 season, that is, in October 1993, between Rs 1,220 and Rs. 1,320 in January, between Rs. 1,280 and Rs. 1,453 in April and between Rs, 1,350 and Rs. 1,630 in May, 1994. However, due to less arrival of imported sugar under OGL and lesser disbursal in the open market, the price remained high till mid-May, 1994. But with the announcement of a quota of 5.60 lakh tonnes for June, 1994 and arrival of imported sugar under OGL and subsequent disbursal in the market, the prices started declining from May

19th or 20th onwards. There has been furhter decline with the release of 6 lakh tonnes of free sale sugar in July and 5.75 lakh tonnes of freesale sugar in August, 1994. In August prices have ruled in the range of Rs. 1,207 and Rs. 1,385 per quintal.

The primary responsibility of curbing speculative tendencies lies with the State Governments through strict enforcement of the provisions of the Essential Commodities Act. However, the following steps have been taken to hold the price line:—

All State Governments were requested in January, 1994 to tighten regulatory controls on sugar dealers and take intensive dehoarding operations. Turnover period for stocks of sugar and khandsari and stock-holding limit for dealers in respect of sugar were reduced. In May, 1994 an order was issued stipulating weekly sales of sugar.

In July, 1994 the State Governments were again requested to enforce various regulatory orders relating to stock-holding limit, turnover period of stocks, etc.

Gur (Control) Order, 1994 was issued in May, 1994 prescribing stock-holding limit and turnover period for gur dealers to discourage speculative hoarding of gur and to have a sobering effect on sugar prices.

Meeting were taken by me and the Secretary, Ministry of Food, with the representatives of the sugar industry and trade to hold the price of sugar at a reasonable level.

Judicious release of freesale quota of sugar was made keeping in view the production, stocks, requirement, availability of alternate sweeteners like gur and khandsari, price trends, etc.

To further facilitate the movement of imported sugar, my Ministry coordinated with the Ministry of Surface Transport and the Ministry of Railways to ensure priority berthing for ships carrying imported sugar and immediate rail movement in covered wagons from ports to the consuming destinations. *(Interruptions)...*

Public undertakings like STC and MMTC are also improting sugar under OGL to meet the requirements of the public distribution system.

A committee has been set up under the chairmanship of the Additional Secretary (Food) to monitor import of sugar under OGL.

Import of raw sugar has been placed under OGL duty free. *(Interruptions)...*

SHRI MOHAMMED AFZAL alias MEEM AFZAL (Uttar Pradesh): Sir, I am on a point of order. *(Interruptions)...*

SHRI KALP NATH RAI: Sugar industry has been persuaded to agree to the conversion of *(Interruptions)...*

SHRI MOHAMMED AFZALa/mjMEEM AFZAL: Sir, I am on a point of order *(Interruptions)...*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SYED SIBTEY RAZI): After this. *(Interruptions)...*

SHRI KALP NATH RAI: ...2.5 lakh tonnes of free sale quota into levy on loan basis for distribution through the PDS. *(Interruptions)...*

SHRI MOHAMMED AFZAL*aliasMEEM* AFZAL: Sir, I am on a point of order. *(Interruptions)...*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SYED SIBTEY RAZI): Let him complete. I will note your name. *(Interruptions)...*Mr. Afzal, I am noting your name.

मिस्टर अफजल, मैंने आपका नाम नोट कर लिया है, आप बाद में बात कर लीजिएगा।

SHRI KALP NATH RAI: In view of the above measures it is expected that the availability of sugar will ease and prices will remain stable at a reasonable level. *(Interruptions)...* I may also mention here... *(Interruptions)...* that the public distribution system is for the benefit of the common man of the country. *(Interruptions)...*

SHRI MOHAMMED AFZALa/iorMEEM AFZAL: Sir, I am on a point of order. *(Interruptions)...*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SYED SIBTEY RAZI): Mr. Minister ...*(Interruptions)...*

SHRI KALP NATH RAI: The price is being maintained at Rs. 9...*(Interruptions)...* per kilogram. *(Interruptions)...*

SHRI MOHAMMED AFZAL *alia* jMEEM AFZAL: Sir, I am on a point of order. *(Interruptions)...*

SHRI KALP NATH RAI: Forty lakh tonnes of sugar ...*(Interruptions)...*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SYED SIBTEY RAZI): After this, I will give you time. *(Interruptions)...*

SHRI MD. SALIM: Sir,...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SYED SIBTEY RAZI): Mr. Salim, please take your seat. *(Interruptions)...*

SHRI MOHAMMED AFZALafiasMEEM AFZAL: Sir, I am on a point of order. *(Interruptions)...*

उपसभाध्यक्ष (सैयद सिब्ते रजी): मंत्री जी, कुछ माननीय सदस्य आपके इस जवाब पर कुछ थोड़े से क्लैरीफिकेशन पूछना चाहते हैं। मैंने उनके नाम लिख लिए

हैं। आप उनके पाइंट्स नोट करके बाद में एक बार फिर जरा सा लास्ट में जवाब दे दीजिएगा। श्री गुरुदास दासगुप्त। ...(व्यवधान)...

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Sir, we are starting another Short Duration Discussion. *(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SYED SIBETY RAZI): No, no. I will allow only some Members to seek clarifications. Yes, Mr. Gurudas Das Gupta. *(Interruptions)*...

श्री मोहम्मद सलीम: रेप्लाई दिए बिना आप भागकर नहीं जा सकते, मंत्री जी। यह कोई चीनी नहीं है, जो घोलकर पी गए। आपको जवाब देना पड़ेगा ...(व्यवधान)...

شری محمد سلیم: ریپلائی دیے بنا آپ بھاگ کر نہیں جا سکتے منتری جی۔ یہ کوئی چینی نہیں ہے جو گھول کر پی گئے۔ آپ کو جواب دینا پڑے گا ..... "مداخلت"...

श्री मोहम्मद अफजल उर्फ मीम अफजल: सर, मेरा पाइंट आफ आर्डर है।

شری محمد افضل عرف م۔ افضل: سر میرا پوائنٹ آف آرڈر ہے۔

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SYED SIBTEY

अफजल, आपका क्या पाइंट आफ आर्डर है? बोलिए लेकिन आप अपने पाइंट आफ आर्डर पर ही रहिएगा।

श्री मोहम्मद अफजल उर्फ मीम अफजल: सर, मंत्री जी ने अपना ब्यान लिखा हुआ पढ़ा है, इसको न किसी ने समझा है और न इन्होंने इसमें आनरेबिल मैम्बर्स द्वारा जो सवाल उठाए गए हैं उनका, ...(व्यवधान)... कहीं किसी मैम्बर के सवाल का, हवाला नहीं दिया। यह एक लिखवाकर, सैक्रेटरी से लाकर के पढ़ दिया है। ...(व्यवधान)... इन्होंने कोई किसी के सवाल का जवाब नहीं दिया। क्या आप यह समझते हैं, मैं आपसे रूलिंग चाहता हूं, सर, कि जो मंत्री जी ने लिखा हुआ वक्तव्य पढ़ा है क्या यह ठीक है? ...(व्यवधान)...

شری محمد افضل عرف م۔ افضل: سر۔ منتری جی نے جو اپنا بیان لکھا ہوا پڑھا ہے اس کو نہ کسی نے سمجھا ہے اور نہ انھوں نے اس میں آنریبل ممبرس دوارا جو سوال اٹھائے گئے ہیں ان کا ..... "مداخلت"..... کہیں کسی ممبر کے سوال کا حوالہ نہیں دیا یہ ایک لکھوا کر سیکریٹری سے لاکر کے پڑھ دیا ہے۔ "مداخلت" انھوں نے کوئی کسی کے سوال کا جواب نہیں دیا۔ کیا آپ یہ سمجھتے ہیں میں آپ سے رولنگ چاہتا ہوں۔ سر۔ کہ جو منتری جی نے لکھا ہوا دکھتوے پڑھا ہے کیا یہ ٹھیک ہے۔ "مداخلت"...

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: Sir, I am on a point of order.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SYED SIBTEY RAZI): Yes, what is your point of order?

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: Sir, while introducing a Bill a Minister can read out his speech. But when he gives reply to the debate the Minister is not supposed to read out his speech, therefore, it should not be considered a reply. This is my point of order.

SHRI GURDAS DAS GUPTA: Sir,...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SYED SIBTEY RAZI): Are you on a point of order or something else? Do you want to seek clarifications? *(Interruptions)*...*The* points of order raised by Mr. Afzal and Mr. Reddy ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: The Minister noted down the Member's queries and he elaborately answered all the points which were raised by the Members. *(Interruptions)*... It doesn't matter whether he read it out or not. What matters is whether he has answered you points or not. *(Interruptions)*... He answered all your points. *(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SYED SIBTEY RAZI): Please take your seats. *(Interruptions)*... What do you want? Don't you want to seek clarifications? *(Interruptions)*... If you don't want to seek clarifications, I will ask the Minister to go. *(Interruptions)*... If you are not interested to seek clarifications, I will ask the Minister to go. *(Interruptions)*... Please don't go. *(Interruptions)*...

Please restore order in the House *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Sir, I am interested to seek clarifications.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SYED SIBTEY RAZI): Please restore order if you want to seek clarifications ...*(interruptions)*... Now, Mr. Gurudas Das Gupta.

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA (West Bengal): Sir, I don't want to go into the quality of the statement, the mode of its reading and the substance of what he has said because the statement all the more proves that he is totally defenceless. He is totally defenceless.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Sir, what is he speaking?

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: I am asking a question.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SYED SIBTEY RAZI): Mr. Gupta, now they are not understanding you. This is the problem. When they spoke, you were not understanding them. Now they are not understanding you. What could I do? ...*(.Interruptions)*...

SHRI AJIT P.K. JOGI(Madhya Pradesh): Sir, Mr. Gupta is contradicting his own statement. What he said is not relevant.

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Sir, what I am saying is that the statement of the Minister is so irrelevant that he is totally defenceless. That is the point of the irrelevance. I don't want to go into that. We have not started a new debate. I am pointing out the inaccuracies. The main point which the Minister is supposed to answer, the main point that has been agitating the minds of the public and the Parliament is: Why the shortage of sugar was there? What was the reason for it and why the Government could not have taken any steps beforehand to price rise?

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SYED SIBTEY RAZI): Please put your pointed question.

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Is it true that a senior official of his Ministry had pointed out well ahead of time that there was likely to be a serious shortage of sugar? Did the Minister deliberately ignore it and even threaten to seek his resignation? Why did he believe that there was no reason to make arrangements for import? These are the main points of my first question. The second question is this. Did the Minister say publicly that the price of sugar in India was too below the international standard and, therefore, there was no necessity to feel afraid if the price goes up. I put these two questions.

AN HON. MEMBER: Is it a point of order. Sir?

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SYED SIBTEY RAZI): It is not a point of order. It is for clarification.

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Let me conclude. I put these questions only to try to make a single point that the shortage of sugar was known and it was deliberately not taken seriously ..*(Interruptions)*....Somebody has made money out of this.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SYED SIBTEY RAZI): Please take your seat.

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA:

उपसभाध्यक्ष (सैयद सिब्ते रज़ी): मंत्री जी, अभी आप जवाब नहीं देंगे, जब सारी बातें हो जाएंगी तब आप जवाब दीजिए। मुझे आपसे अनुरोध यह करना है कि माननीय सदस्य जो कह रहे हैं, उनको आप नोट कर लीजिए और बाद में सब बातों का एक साथ उत्तर दे दीजिए।

श्री Now, Dr. Biplab Dasgupta. **लाइए।**

उपसभाध्यक्ष (सैयद सिब्ते रज़ी): पार्टी वाइज़ क्या, यह मैम्बर्स कह रहे हैं।...(व्यवधान)... अगर पार्टी वाइज़ बात कहते हैं तो फिर मैं एक मैम्बर को ही बुलाऊंगा एक पार्टी से।

You know, there is some system in this House. If you insist that it should be according to the partyline, then I will ask only the leaders to speak. The Minister has to attend the other House also. Therefore, please be brief. Now, it is according to the partyline. Mr. Mathur, you speak now *(Interruptions)*... I am very sorry, Mr. Gupta. I have to go according to the wishes of the House

आब्जेक्शन नहीं कर रहा, मेरा कहना केवल यह है कि उनको मेरे बाद बोलने दिया जाए। मेरा क्लेरिफिकेशन यह है कि स्टेटमेंट में कोई बात स्पष्ट नहीं कही गई है। मंत्री जी रिकार्ड पर हैं, उन्होंने अपने सैक्रेटरी को, दूसरे अधिकारियों को सदन में, सदन के बाहर एक्यूज़ किया था कि इन लोगों ने गड़बड़ी की है। तो लिहाज़ा मैं पूछना चाहता हूं कि उन

The Minister is also not aware of any. ..*(Interruptions)*

अधिकारियों के बारे में आपकी सरकार ने क्या कुछ फैसला किया, क्या किया है, बताइए?

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SYED SIBTEY RAZI): Now, Dr. Biplab

श्री विजय कुमार मल्होत्रा: दो आदमी एक ही पार्टी से बोल रहे हैं।

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SYED SIBTEY RAZI): Now, it is according to the partyline. Mr. Gupta is from CPI and Dr. Biplab Dasgupta is from CPM.

SHRI BIPLAB DASGUPTA (West Bengal): Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, I don't want to repeat what we had discussed the other day. But the quetion is: How does one explain the lack of decision-making at the appropriate time when the import was necessitated? Now, the suspicion has arisen for a number of reasons because of the various statements made by the Minister in the Conference of the Sugar Manufacturer's
Association, in the Cabinet and in other places. Sir, many questions have been raised. He must answer these questions. I would like to know whether he has not. made such categorical statements in various meetings. Sir, he said that the price of sugar should be raised because the price of sugar is cheap in India. Is it not true that he made a statement that as long as he remains the Minister he would not allow any import of sugar? He should also explain this. What is his relationship with Mr. Jain, Chairman, Sugar Manufacturers Association. ...*{Interruptions).*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SYED SIBTEY RAZI): I am not permitting you. *(Interruptions).* You can seek any clarification on the statement which the Minister has made. *(Interruptions).* It will not go on record. *(Interruptions).* Nothing is going on record.

DR. BIPLAB DASGUPTA: * SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: *

SHRI KALP NATH RAI: I contradict .. ..*(Interruptions).*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SYED SIBTEY RAZI): Mr. Minister, please take your seat. *(Interruptions).* Mr. Biplab Dasgupta, there is a point of order. Please take your seat. You can only put pointed questions. I am not going to give you the floor for making a speech.

DR. BIPLAB DAS GUPTA: Sir, what I am saying is this. *(Interruptions).*

SHRI MADAN BHATIA (Nominated): Sir, I respectfully submit that you have already given a ruling that if any hon. Member wants to seek any clarification with regard to the statement which the hon. Minister has made, he can seek clarification. But under the garb of clarifications he cannot start a debate again and make a speech. This is what is happening. *(Interruptions).*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SYED SIBTEY RAZI): Please take your seat. *(Interruptions).* Don't be so agitated. *(Interruptions).* Please take your seat. *(Interruptions).* Nothing will go on record without my permission. Shri S. Jaipal Reddy.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: Sir, I have one simple clarification to seek. In view of the fact that the reply of the Minister is not only irrelevant but also far from transparent, how does the Government come clean on this question? Will the Government agree for an inquiry by a sitting Supreme Court Judge or an inquiry by the Public Accounts Committee?

SHRI MADAN BHATIA: Sir, the hon. Member was not here when the Minister made the statement.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SYED SIBTEY RAZI): Mr. Bhatia, please take your seat. The Minister will reply when his turn comes.

SHRI SANJAY DALMIA (Uttar Pradesh). Sir, I want to seek two clarifications. The Minister has said that the sugar shortage has happened because of the diversion of cane to *gur* in UP. Is this the policy of the Government of India not to allow the farmers to do value addition? Or, is there some restriction that beyond a certain quantity *gur* will not be allowed to be made? This is my first question for clarification. My second question for clarification is this. As far as imports are concerned, the State Government has no jurisdiction upon imports. This matter is entirely with the Central Government. The practice is, if sugar is not available then raw sugar could be imported. But they did not import the raw sugar. I would like to know from the hon. Minister: If there was some problem in getting sugar, why did they not import raw sugar ?—Thank You.

श्री ईश दत्त यादव (उत्तर प्रदेश): माननीय उपसभाध्यक्ष जी, मंत्री जी का जो बयान है वह अधूरा है। इन्होंने जो एक बात कही, जिसका सम्बन्ध चीनी घोटाले से नहीं है, इसको यह बार-बार कहते हैं कि उत्तर प्रदेश की सरकार ने गुड़ और खांडसारी पर से प्रतिबंध हटा दिया इसलिए चीनी की शोर्टेज हो गई। चीनी की शोर्टेज हुई, इसको

* Not recorded.

मंगाने की व्यवस्था होनी चाहिए थी, जो कुछ करना चाहिए था यह करते। लेकिन एक सवाल मैं आपके माध्यम से पूछना चाहता हूं कि क्या उत्तर प्रदेश की सरकार ने और वहां के मुख्य मंत्री ने गन्ने का रेट 41 रुपए प्रति क्विंटल किया या नहीं और खांडसारी और गुड़ पर से जो प्रतिबंध उठाया, इससे उत्तर प्रदेश के किसान मालामाल हुए कि या नहीं और अगर यह बात सही है तो इनका बयान अधूरा है। इनका बयान तो उत्तर प्रदेश की सरकार को धन्यवाद देने का आना चाहिए था कि उत्तर प्रदेश की सरकार ने गन्ने का रेट बढ़ाकर 41 रुपए प्रति क्विंटल किया और खांडसारी तथा गुड़ पर से प्रतिबंध हटाया जिससे गन्ना किसानों को मालामाल किया है। ऐसा यह धन्यवाद प्रस्ताव इनके बयान में आना चाहिए था।

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Sir, the Minister is not taking notes... *(Interruptions)...He* is not taking notes. How will he answer? ...*(Interruptions)*....

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SYED SIBTEY RAZI): He is a very sharpmemoried person...*(Interruptions)*....I think so. Since he is not taking notes, he might be taking notes in his own mind. So, I cannot compel a Minister. I had already said in the very beginning....*(Interruptions)*... No, I am sorry....*(Interruptions)*.... Mr. Gurudas Das Gupta, please take your seat...*(Interruptions)*...

PROF. VIJAY KUMAR MALHOTRA: Sir, ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SYED SIBTEY RAZI): I will see, if there is time. I will try to accommodate you. But I can't promise you.

SHRI MD. SALIM: Sir, he takes notes outside.. ..*(Interruptions)*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SYED SIBTEY RAZI): Please. Let other Members also have the privilege to ask for clarifications.... *(Interruptions)*.... Mr. Biplab Das Gupta, it is not good, I remind you. I will try to ....*(Interruptions)*...

श्री दिग्विजय सिंह (बिहार): उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, मंत्री जी का अभी जो बयान आया है उससे जो बुनियादी सवाल पूरे देश भर में और इस सदन में चर्चा के दौरान जो सदस्यों ने रखे हैं, उसके जवाब के बारे में मैं मंत्री जी से बहुत पौइंटेड सवाल पूछना चाहता हूं। ऐसा माहौल मंत्री जी के बयान से, मंत्री जी द्वारा दूसरे सदन में दिए गए वक्तव्य से यह जानकारी मिली है कि मंत्री जी ने जो कुछ किया है वह सारा प्रधान मंत्री की जानकारी में किया है। मैं सीधा सवाल आपसे पूछना चाहता हूं कि आपने जो जो काम किया है, क्या उसकी जानकारी प्रधान मंत्री को थी या नहीं, और नहीं थी तो आप उसे हम लोगों को बताइए? तब मैं यही कहूंगा कि हम जो विपक्ष के लोग हैं, खामोखां की ओर जा रहे हैं तो कोई और है। इसलिए मैं मंत्री जी से यह चाहूंगा कि....(व्यवधान)

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: On every issue, you can't come to the Prime Minister. It has become a fashion by the Opposition. ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SYED *Sing,h...(Interruption* दिग्विजय सिंह जी, आप तो इस सदन के बहुत संयमित सदस्य रहे हैं, इसलिए मैं आपसे गुजारिश करूंगा।

श्री दिग्विजय सिंह: मैं ऐसी कौन सी बात कह रहा हूं कि जो सदन की मर्यादा के खिलाफ है।....(व्यवधान) चापलूस लोग कल्पनाथ जी की बात करेंगे। यह मेरे भी अच्छे दोस्त हैं कल्पनाथ जी।.....(व्यवधान)

उपसभाध्यक्ष (सैयद सिब्ते रज़ी): प्लीज, प्लीज। चेयर की तरफ मुखातिब हों।Please address the Chair.

श्री दिग्विजय सिंह: उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, मैं तो आप ही की तरफ मुखातिब होकर बोल रहा हूं।....(व्यवधान) उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, मैं इसलिए कह रहा हूं कि यह मंत्री जी के हित में भी है। पूरा देश इस बात से उद्वेलित है। इसकी जानकारी देश को दे दें तो इसमें क्या नुकसान है। SIBTEY RAZI): You come to clarifications, Mr. Digvijay ....*(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SYED SIBTEY RAZI): Your time is up now. Shri V. Narayanasamy please.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, the hon. Minister was saying that a large quantity of sugar...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI DIPANKAR MUKHERJEE: Please ask the question....*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MD. SALIM: Please ask your question. ..*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, the hon. Minister has said that a large quantity of sugarcane...*(Interruptions)*.. Kindly hear *me...(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MD. SALIM: He has fully understood the *Ucls...(Interruptions)*...

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Let us be very serious about it. Sir, the hon. Minister has said in his statement that a large quantity of sugarcane has been diverted to gur production. And it is a fact that in U.P., Maharashtra and Andhra Pradesh it has been done because the reason is that the prices that have been paid to the fanners for the sugarcane are far less as compared to the return they get from gur. That

is the reason. Therefore, I would like to know this fromi the hon. Minister. The Minister also gave a statement in Karnataka that the Government is planning to dam the gur production which will lead to serious consequences because the people in the northern part of our country take gur as one of their food items. Apart from that, gur is also used for feeding cattle. Sir, the statement which the Minister has given is creating a lot of furore in the southern part of the country and especially in Andhra Pradesh from where Mr. Jaipal Reddy comes. There is resentment in other States too. Therefore, I want a clarification from the hon. Minister.. .*(Interruptions)*...

Kindly hear me... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Thou too Brutus'.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Sir, I want a very clear statement from the Minister that the farmers' interest would be safeguarded. Secondly, Sir, there is a tendency in the international market, whether it is London or anywhere else, whenever ...*(Interruptions)*... Kindly hear me ...*(Interruptions)*... I seek your protection, Sir. ...*(Interruptions)*... Yes, I seek ine protection of the Chair.

[THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN *in the Chair]*

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Madam, the Minister has given his reply. I want to seek two Salifications. Now, I want to seek my second :larification.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Why Salification? This is not a statement, that was i reply. Why do you change the procedure?

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: The Chair has permitted me, Madam. I want to tell the hon. Minister that whenever India goes for purchase of any essential item in the international market what is happening is that the prices are jacked up by the international traders. ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Narayanasamy, the procedure is that... No, no ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Otherwise my question will be incomplete. I would like to suggest to the hon. Minister that whenever they go for purchase in future let them negotiate and purchase at a lesser price.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: One second, please. ...*(Interruptions)*... The Minister was replying to the discussion... No, please. One minute ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MD. SALIM: He has brought a new statement. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री दिग्विजय कुमार मल्होत्रा: चेयरमैन ने कहा था कि आप इसके बाद क्वेश्चन पूछ सकते हैं और आप इनसे क्लेरिफिकेशन पूछिए जो क्रिसाइड कर रहे थे। तो इसलिए हमने...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Jaipalji, I will call you, one minute. I will call you.**अच्छा**

आप खामोश रहिए। एक सेकेंड बैठ जाइए।

श्री प्रकाश यशवन्त अम्बेडकर (नाम निर्देशित): ये ऐब्यूज़ कर रहे हैं अपने मैम्बर को।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I did not hear it. ...*(Interruptions)*...

मंत्री जी (व्यवधान) एक सेकेंड जयपाल जी, प्लीज़। मंत्री जी आपने जवाब दिया बराबर सब सवालों का? ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री विजयकुमार मल्होत्रा: मैडम, इन्होंने कोई जवाब दिया ही नहीं। ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री दिग्विजय सिंह: अभी तो सवाल शुरू हुआ है।

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Madam, the Chairperson allowed us to put questions. Why are you not allowing? Let him answer that. Let him answer that. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: Madam, I wish to draw your attention to the fact that I wrote a letter to you seeking permission to authenticate and lay a copy of the CBI report from which I quoted. I need to authenticate it because I need to substantiate the points that I made. I need to support the quotation I took recourse to. Therefore, you kindly [1.00 P.M.] permit me to lay a true copy of the CBI report which I have duly authenticated, Madam. I am doing it at my risk. Madam, I am doing it at my complete risk. I have observed all the formalities scrupulously and sedulously. I,

therefore,

...*(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: When a senior Member is speaking, I think courtesy demands that everybody should keep quiet because I have to give my ruling on it. If I do not hear what he is saying, how do you expect me to say a word? I will just adjourn the House and go. So, let me hear him.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: Madam, I, therefore, request you to permit me to lay it on the Table of the House. I have observed all the forms and procedures in this respect scruoulously and sedulously. I, therefore.

you to permit me to lay it on the Table of the House.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Jaipal Reddy, this is the reason why I went into my chamber and 1 asked you to show me the document. 1 have gone through it. There has been a precedent in this House by the previous Chairman who has permitted a document to be laid on the Table of the House, if a Member has levelled any charges against anybody he has to substantiate it. This is one rule. So, you have to substantiate it with the document you have brought. But, when I went through the document, I found some Ministers' names there. I would also write to them. While I allow you to lay it on the Table of the House to substantiate your allegations with a duly authenticated document, I have to write to the particular Minister because he should have the right to come before this House and clarify his position, because we cannot allow a Minister or a Member against whom charges are levelled, to go without an opportunity to explain his position. So, I will send a copy.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: Very nice of you, Madam. Let me now beg to lay a true copy of the CBI report. I hereby lay it on the Table of the House. I lay it on the Table of the House.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will have to write to the Minister. He will have to come here and clarify. That is a different thing. The precedent in this House is that he has the right. Otherwise, I have to remove everything from the record whatever he has said. How can I allow that thing to go on record, what he said, what he spoke in the House, whatever allegations he was levelling against anybody? He has to substantiate it. And, in support of that he is authenticating certain documents and asking for permission to lay it on the Table of the House. The responsibility of authentication of those documents is entirely on Mr. Jaipal Reddy and he has said that he will take the entire responsibility. Having said that, there are some names. That is why I was reading the paper. I found the name of some Minister and it is my duty that I should write to the person or the Chairman should write to the person to get his clarification.

SYED SIBTEY RAZI: ...*(Interruptions)*.. The Minister wants to reply. So many things had been said against him ...*(Interruptions)*... Give the

उपसभापति: मिनिस्टर साहब, आप दो तीन मिनट में रिप्लाई कर दीजिए। मुझे हाउस ऐडजार्न करना है।

प्रो. विजय कुमार मल्होत्रा: महोदया, जो स्टेटमेंट मिस्टर साहब ने प्रेस में दिया है, जो स्टेटमेंट आप ने टी.वी. में दिया है, जिस में आप ने सेक्रेटरी को करप्ट कहा है, मिनिस्टर सुखराम को कहा है, सी.बी.आई. इंक्वायरी में कहा है, जितनी स्टेटमेंट आप ने की है उस का जवाब दीजिए। प्राइम मिनिस्टर आफिस से करप्शन हुआ या आप के सेक्रेटरी से हुआ, इस का जवाब दीजिए।...*(Interruptions)*..

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: We have had a long, long discussion on the subject. Please... Today is the last day. We have other business also. Let him answer. Let me get-satisfied with what

श्री कल्पनाथ राय: मैं आदरणीय जयपाल रेड्डी जी, आदरणीय माथुर जी, आदरणीय मुफ्ती, आदरणीय विप्लव दास गुप्त, मैं सभी ...(**व्यवधान**)

उपसभापति: आप सकाटे से सुनिये, खामोशी से सुनिए। कल्पनाथ जी आप चेयर के बारे में बोलिए..(**व्यवधान**)

श्री कल्पनाथ राय: हमारे नारायणसामी जी और सभी को एक ही बात का जवाब देना है:

तुम सीने में तीर मारो बेशक,
लेकिन याद रखना सीने में दिल है।
और दिल में तेरे लिए भी मुकाम है, जयपाल रेड्डी जी।

(**व्यवधान**)

श्री दिग्विजय सिंह: सारा जवाब हो गया। (**व्यवधान**)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am sorry the Minister did not give the full answer. I do not know why he has walked out of the House.

SHRI V. GOPALSAMY (Tamil Nadu): It is insult to the House ..*(Interruptions)*

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: There has been no such precedent in the House...*(Interruptions)*. ...Never before apologise... **व्यवधान)**

डा. मुरली मनोहर जोशी (उत्तर प्रदेश): यह सदन की अवमानना है, अवहेलना है। (**व्यवधान**)। सभापति के आसन की अवहेलना की गई है। यह आपका अपमान भी किया गया है, सदन का अपमान भी किया गया है। यह बिल्कुल एक प्रकार की उद्दंडता और धृष्टता का परिचय दिया गया है। मंत्री महोदय ने जिस उद्दंडता का परिचय दिया है उसके लिए उन्हें क्षमा मांगनी चाहिए। (**व्यवधान**) यह भर्त्सनीय धृष्टता है, सदन का अपमान है। (**व्यवधान**)

उपसभापति: बैठिये, एक मिनट मेरी सुनिये, खामोशी

से बैठ जाइए। मिस्टर कल्पनाथ राय, इस हाउस में प्रधान मंत्री आते हैं, बड़े-बड़े सीनियर मिनिस्टर्स आते है जो आप से भी सीनियर है। जूनियर मिनिस्टर आते है। इस हाउस की एक गरिमा है। आप सवाल का जवाब दे रहे थे और आपने चेयर की परमिशन से जवाब दिया है इसलिए आपको चेयर से परमिशन लेकर ही जाना चाहिए था। हम लोग सारे दिन तो आप को बैठाने वाले नहीं थे। आपने जवाब दिया, आपने शेर पढ़ा

and you walked out. This is not the way. It has never happened in this House. As I ask the Members to keep the dignity of this House, I request you also to keep the dignity of this House. I have presided when Mrs. Gandhi and Shri Rajiv Gandhi and two other Prime Ministers and the present Prime Minister have been here. It never happened during the time when I was presiding that a Minister would just walk out. It is part of a parliamentary democracy: the opposition is going to oppose you and it is your responsibility as a Minister to reply to the best of your ability. By running away you are not going to shed your responsibility as a Minister. You just say that on the basis of whatever information you had, you replied. 1 think it is proper that you should apologise to the House.

SHRI KALPNATH RAI: I apologise. Madam, I am sorry.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN (SYED SIBTEY RAZI): Now the House is adjourned for lunch till 2.30 P.M.

The House then adjourned for lunch at ten minutes past one of the clock.

The House reassembled after lunch at thirty-one minutes past two of the clock,

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN in the Chair.

उपसभापतिः आज वैसे तो हम लोगों का प्राइवेट मैंबर्स का लैजिस्लेटिव बिज़िनेस है, मगर विद्याचरण शुक्ल जी, पार्लियामेंटरी अफेयर्स मिनिस्टर हाऊस में आए हुए हैं। आपने जो शंका उठायी थी कि एक करोड़ रुपये का क्या होगा, हमको मिलेगा या नहीं मिलेगा, इसके बारे में ये सब मैंबर्स को चिन्ता थी और उसके बारे में हमने पार्लियामेंटरी अफेयर्स मिनिस्टर से कहा। हम लोगों को इस बात की खुशी है कि विद्याचरण शुक्ल जी आज हाऊस में आए हैं। आप आऊस खत्म होने से पहले बताइए कि क्या होगा?

श्री संघ प्रिय गौतम (उत्तर प्रदेश): संशोधन, हमने यह नहीं कहा कि हमको मिलेगा, हमारे द्वारा पब्लिक को मिलेगा। हम क्यों लेंगे?

उपसभापतिः अब आप इतनी बारीकियों में जाएंगे। एक बात में बताऊं संघ प्रिय गौतम जी कि जितनी आप बारीक छानेंगे, उतनी ही उसके अंदर मिट्टी मिलती है। देखिए चुप-चाप रहिए।.....(व्यवधान).....पैसा जो मिल रहा है, वह आपके लिए नहीं मिल रहा है, हमारे लिए नहीं मिल रहा है, इस देश की जनता के लिए सरकार दे रही है, जिस काम के लिए यह जरूरी है। तो मंत्री जी इस पर बोलने के लिए आए हैं।

श्री सुरेश पचौरी (मध्य प्रदेश): महोदया, प्राइवेट मैंबर्स बिल का जो इंट्राडक्शन है, उसमें पांच मिनट लगेंगे।

उपसभापतिः यह हो जाए, एक मिनट में। कोई क्लैरीफिकेशंस नहीं होंगे, मंत्री जी बोलकर चले जाएंगे, चार लाइन का है, फिर सारा इंट्राडक्शन करा देंगे।

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज (हरियाणा): महोदय, मंत्री जी यहां बयान देने के लिए आए हैं, इसके लिए हमें आपका आभार प्रकट करना चाहिए, जिन्होंने यह इश्यू क्लिंच कर दिया और मंत्री जी को यहां आने पर मजबूर कर दिया, वरना यह मुद्दा तो निकल गया था, हम लोग तो चीख-चाखकर, बोल-बालकर रह गये थे। यह तो आपने सरकार को निर्देश दिया और कहा कि सदन का सत्र समाप्त होने से पहले मंत्री जी आएं और बोले हम, बल्कि सभी संसद सदस्य आपके प्रति आभार प्रकट करते हैं कि आपने मंत्री जी को बुला दिया।

उसभापतिः हम तो आभार प्रकट करते हैं कि मंत्री जी लेकर आए हैं। अच्छी चीज़ किसी की भी वजह से हुई, दिया तो प्रधान मंत्री जी ने।.....(व्यवधान)

STATEMENT BY MINISTER M.Ps. Local Area Development Programme

THE MINISTER OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRI VIDYACHARAN SHUKLA): Madam Deputy Chairman, I would like to clarify that it has been decided that a separate Fund would be constituted for M.Ps. Local Area Development Scheme in order to streamline its im- plementation and to remove the difficulties experienced by the hon. Members of Parliament. Suitable amendments would also be made in the Guidelines in this regard.

श्री संघ प्रिय गौतम (उत्तर प्रदेश): जिलों में पैसा कब तक पहुंच जाएगा?....(व्यवधान)

उप सभापतिः अभी कोई क्लैरीफिकेशन नहीं। आप बैठिए।

SYED SIBTEY RAZI (Uttar Pradesh): Madam Deputy Chairman, on behalf of my Party, I thank the hon. Minister....

SHRI SATYA PRAKASH MALVIYA (Uttar Pradesh): On behalf of the whole House.. ..*(Interruptions)*

SYED SIBTEY RAZI: Madam, we are grateful to Shri Rameshwar Takur and Shri Shukla. *(Interruptions)* We are grateful to them for clarifying the position. This would enable the implementation of the essential projects as early as possible, in the different areas. We are